# **Evaluation of Rare Earth Element-Associated Hormetic Effects in Candidate Fertilizers and Livestock Feed Additives**

Franca Tommasi<sup>1</sup> · Philippe J. Thomas<sup>2</sup> · Daniel M. Lyons<sup>3</sup> · Giovanni Pagano<sup>4</sup> · Rahime Oral<sup>5</sup> · Antonietta Siciliano<sup>6</sup> · Maria Toscanesi<sup>4</sup> · Marco Guida<sup>6</sup> · Marco Trifuoggi<sup>4</sup>

Received: 10 February 2022 / Accepted: 13 June 2022  $\ensuremath{\mathbb{O}}$  The Author(s) 2022

#### Abstract

Rare earth elements (REEs) are recognized as emerging contaminants with implications in human and environmental health. Apart from their adverse effects, REEs have been reported as having positive effects when amended to fertilizers and livestock feed additives, thus suggesting a hormetic trend, implying a concentration-related shift from stimulation to inhibition and toxicity, with analogous trends that have been assessed for a number of xenobiotics. In view of optimizing the success of REE mixtures in stimulating crop yield and/or livestock growth or egg production, one should foresee the comparative concentration-related effects of individual REEs (e.g., Ce and La) vs. their mixtures, which may display distinct trends. The results might prompt further explorations on the use of REE mixtures vs. single REEs aimed at optimizing the preparation of fertilizers and feed additives, in view of the potential recognition of their use in agronomy and zootechny.

Keywords Rare earth elements · Hormesis · Toxicity · Fertilizer · Feed additive · Mixture

### Introduction

Rare earth elements (REEs) are a group of metals encompassing lanthanoids from lanthanum to lutetium, as well as yttrium and scandium, that have become indispensable in present-day life because of their critical role in many modern and cutting-edge technologies [1, 2]. In recent decades, an extensive body of literature on REE-associated adverse effects in a number of biota and laboratory test models has

Giovanni Pagano paganog756@gmail.com

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Biology, "Aldo Moro" Bari University, I-70125 Bari, Italy
- <sup>2</sup> Environment and Climate Change Canada, Science & Technology Branch, National Wildlife Research Center – Carleton University, Ottawa, ON K1A 0H3, Canada
- <sup>3</sup> Center for Marine Research, Ruder Bošković Institute, HR-52210 Rovinj, Croatia
- <sup>4</sup> Department of Chemical Sciences, Federico II Naples University, via Cintia, I-80126 Naples, Italy
- <sup>5</sup> Faculty of Fisheries, Ege University, TR-35100 Bornova, İzmir, Turkey
- <sup>6</sup> Department of Biology, Federico II Naples University, I-80126 Naples, Italy

given cause for concern that environmental REE exposures may have deleterious impacts on flora and fauna [3]. A growing body of literature on human REE exposures in mining areas, including facilities dedicated to REE extraction and manufacturing, increasingly points to REE bioaccumulation and excretion. These include environmental, non-occupational exposures among residents in REE mining areas [4, 5], and point to the still many knowledge gaps on potential health risks in REE-exposed workers [6, 7].

Apart from industrial applications, REEs have been extensively used in Chinese agriculture as fertilizers to increase crop yield, and in zootechny as feed additives aimed at increasing livestock growth and egg laying, with likely prospects of their utilization outside China [7–10].

The REE-associated adverse effects and their stimulatory actions in plant and animal growth may be regarded as one more case of the hormesis phenomenon, as reviewed by Calabrese [11] and by Calabrese and Agathokleous [12].

In view of a possible hormetic trend for REEs, just as for an extensive number of agents already reported in the literature, it is increasingly clear that testing the dose–response trends of individual REEs as well as their combinations is of growing importance to identify the concentration ranges and combinations which can give rise to hormetic or toxic effects [13]. Resolving the doses at which hormesis may occur, as



well as the nature of the hormetic effects, are discussed in the present review, with a special focus on the present state of art, as yet confined to Chinese agriculture and zootechny and on the possible extension of REE utilization in the production of fertilizers and feed additives in other countries, by appropriate authorization from food safety agencies.

#### **Materials and Methods**

A detailed reference search of the literature was carried out using the PubMed, Scopus, and ScienceDirect databases by interfacing the following keywords:

- 1) Rare earth elements vs. hormesis; vs. toxicity; vs. fertilizer; vs. feed additive, and vs. mixture
- 2) Hormesis vs. metal, and vs. mixture

No data from human REE exposures are reported in the present review.

#### **REE-Associated Adverse Effects**

After the pioneering studies by Drobkov [14] in 1941 on the effects of REEs on the development of peas, and by Jha and Singh [15, 16] assessing the induction of cytogenetic damage by two REEs (praseodymium and neodymium) in mice and in broad bean (Vicia faba), a thriving literature over recent decades has provided established evidence for a number of REE-associated adverse effects in a number of test models, as summarized in Table 1. Studies of REE toxicity in plant models were carried out on several crop and native species, showing decreased seed germination, root elongation, and mitotic activity for REE levels  $\leq$  5.0 mg/L [17–22]. More extensive studies of REE-associated toxicity were conducted in several animal models including mammals (mice and rats), fish (Danio rerio), and sea urchins, providing evidence for a number of adverse effects, including oxidative damage, lung and kidney toxicity, and developmental and cytogenetic damage [23-37]. Altogether, the available body of literature on the adverse effects of REE exposures raises environmental health concerns.

#### **REE-Associated Hormetic Trends**

Analogous to a number of chemical and physical agents [11, 38], REE dose–response trends have been associated with hormesis, a phenomenon leading to stimulate (Greek: hormào) biological activities at lower concentrations compared to inhibition, bioaccumulation, and toxicity at higher exposure concentrations [39]. As shown in Table 2, evidence

for REE-associated hormetic trends were reported in a set of studies conducted in several biota including plants, fungi, microbiota, and animals.

In particular, plant models including rice, bean, cabbage, and orange were exposed to varying levels of La, Ce, and Sc by testing some key endpoints including growth, germination, chlorophyll content, and oxidative stress parameters. The results reported on concentration-related hormetic trends in REE-exposed plants [40-48]. de Oliveira et al. [43] tested  $La^{3+}$  exposures (5 to 150  $\mu$ M) in soybean plants, by measuring a set of endpoints at low REE concentrations as plant growth, nutritional characteristics, photosynthetic rate, chlorophyll content, mitotic index, modifications in the ultrastructure of roots and leaves, and La mapping in root and shoot tissues. When La was applied, it was noted that the levels of some essential nutrients (Ca, P, K, and Mn) increased. Low La concentrations enhanced the photosynthetic rate and total chlorophyll content and led to a higher incidence of binucleate cells, with a slight increase in root and shoot biomass. At higher La levels, soybean growth was reduced. Liu et al. [44] tested La<sup>3+</sup> (0.05 to 1.5 mM) in rice plants for effects on reactive oxygen species and antioxidant metabolism. The results indicated that ROS levels declined after treatment with 0.05 mM La<sup>3+</sup>, with hormetic effects on the antioxidant metabolism in rice roots. Further, d'Aquino et al. [49] tested Trichoderma fungi to REE exposures ranging from 0.003 to 900 mM, and found increased growth of fungal biomass at low REE concentrations. Extending this work to bacteria, E. coli or microbial communities were exposed to several REEs by Técher et al. [50] and to Y(III) by Su et al. [51], who found increased growth kinetics and ammonia-oxidizing bacteria at low (<20 mg/L) Y(III) concentrations but were inhibited by higher ( $\geq 20$  mg/L) Y(III) concentrations.

Several studies of REE-associated hormetic effects were conducted in animal models (Table 2). Jenkins et al. [52] tested human dermal fibroblasts for profibrotic injury when exposed to REEs and found increased proliferation by low concentrations of REEs (1 to 10  $\mu$ M), which turned to inhibition at higher (50 to 100  $\mu$ M) REE concentrations. Decreased inflammatory parameters were reported by Hirst et al. [53] in mice exposed to low concentrations of CeO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles. More recently, Zhang et al. [54] tested the response of rats to Y<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> exposure for growth endpoints, which were found to increase at low concentrations (20 ppm) and decrease at higher Y<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> concentrations (320 ppm).

#### **REEs in Fertilizers**

The established use of REEs as fertilizer components in Chinese agriculture dates back to the 1980s and was reported in early reviews [7, 55, 56]. A few reports in the past decade

Test models	Test REFs [concentration]	Endnoints	Ohserved effects	References
	[]			
Plants				
Triticum aestivum	La and Ce [0.5–25 mg/L]	Root elongation; dry weight of roots and shoots; content of mineral elements	Decreased parameters	Hu et al. [17]
Brassica juncea var. crispifolia	La[III] [0.05–5.0 mg/L]	Root elongation; Fe, Mn, and Zn accumula- tion	La [≥ 1.0 mg/L] inhibited root elongation and metal accumulation	Xiong et al. [18]
5 native and crop plants	La, Ce, and Y [20–2000 mg/kg]	Germination and harvest	Decreased germination	Thomas et al. [19]
6 native and crop plants	Pr, Nd, Sa, Tb, Dy, Er [100–700 mg/kg]	Seed germination; speed of germination	Decreased germination	Carpenter et al. [20]
Allium cepa	La and Ce [0–200 mg/L]	Root growth; mitotic index and frequency of aberrant cells	Decreased growth; mitotic index and increased aberrant cells	Kotelnikova et al. [21]
Raphidocelis subcapitata	La and Ce [0–0.5 mg/L]	Growth inhibition; superoxide dismutase, catalase	Decreased growth, increased oxidative stress	Siciliano et al. [22]
Animals				
Mice [adult and fetal]	CeCl <sub>3</sub> [gavage] [200 or 500 mg/kg BW]	Pulmonary hemorrhage [adults], pulmonary and hepatic vascular congestion [neonatal]	Increased pulmonary damage	Kawagoe et al. [23]
Wistar rats	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [gavage] [0.1–40 mg/kg]	Behavioral performance: $[Ca^{2+1}]$ , level; $Ca^{2+}_{i-1}$ ATPase in hippocampal cells; oxidative stress	Increased Ca <sup>2+</sup> ,-ATPase; decreased activities of antioxidant enzymes	He et al. [24]
Rats	CeO <sub>2</sub> [nanoparticles] [175–250 mg/kg]	Oxidative stress endpoints	Increased oxidative stress in cortex, hip- pocampus, and cerebellum	Hardas et al. [25]
Mice	La, Ce, and Nd[III] [by gavage]; [10, 20, or 40 mg/kg BW/day] 6 weeks	Accumulation in hepatocyte, nuclei, and mitochondria	Oxidative damage in hepatic nuclei and mitochondria	Huang et al. [26]
Sprague–Dawley rats	CeO <sub>2</sub> nanoparticles [1.0–7.0 mg/kg]	Liver ceria levels; serum alanine transami- nase; albumin levels	Decreased liver weight; hydropic degenera- tion; hepatocyte	Nalabotu et al. [27]
ICR mice	LaCl <sub>3</sub> , CeCl <sub>3</sub> , and NdCl <sub>3</sub> [20 mg/kg BW, i.p.]	Brain injury; oxidative stress	Increased brain injury and oxidative stress	Zhao et al. [28]
ICR mice	CeCl <sub>3</sub> [gavage] [2–20 mg/kg BW]	Hepatocyte ultrastructure; oxidative stress; kidney structure	Increased ROS formation; inhibited stress- related gene expression	Zhao et al. [29, 30]
CD1 Mice	CeO <sub>2</sub> nanoparticles [2 mg/m <sup>3</sup> ]	Pro-inflammatory cytokines; oxidative stress markers	Increased pro-inflammatory condition	Aalapati et al. [31]
Mice	CeCl <sub>3</sub> [2 mg/kg] via gavage	Liver injury and gene-expressed profiles	Decreased counts of white blood cells; lymphocytes; platelets; reticulocyte count; neutrophilic granulocyte percentages; A/G ratio	Cheng et al. [32]
Mice	CeCl <sub>3</sub> [nasally instilled]	Pro-inflammatory lung parameters; serum triglyceride levels	Oxidative stress and inflammatory cytokine expression; sinusoidal dilatation	Hong et al. [33]
Caenorhabditis elegans	$La^{3+}$ [10 $\mu$ M]	Growth and reproduction	Significant adverse effects	Zhang et al. [34]
Zebrafish embryos	$La^{3+}$ or $Yb^{3+}$ [0.01 to 1 mM]	Developmental defects and mortality	Increased damage	Cui et al. [35]
3 sea urchin species [embryos and sperm]	7 REE chlorides [10 <sup>-6</sup> –10 <sup>-4</sup> M]	Developmental defects; fertilization success; offspring anomalies; cytogenetic damage	Increased developmental defects; decreased fertilization; increased cytogenetic anoma- lies	Oral et al. [36]; Trifuoggi et al. [37]

Table 2 Hormetic effects in growth endpoints	oints			
Test models	Test REEs [concentration]	Endpoints	Observed effects	References
Plants				
Rice [Oryza sativa]	La[NO <sub>3</sub> ] <sub>3</sub> [20–1500 µg/mL]	Germination of rice seeds; chlorophyll contents; root growth	Increased parameters	Fashui et al. [40]
Broad bean [Vicia faba]	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [108–195 µg/g]	Superoxide dismutase; catalase; ascorbate peroxidase; HSP 70	Hormetic effects	Wang et al. [41]
Chinese cabbage [Brassica rapa]	LaCl <sub>3</sub> and CeCl <sub>4</sub>	Soluble sugar, titratable acid, nitrate and vitamin C	La more effective than Ce; different data Ma et al. [42] for autumn vs. spring plantation	Ma et al. [42]
Soybean [Glycine max]	La[III] [5–150 µM]	Growth; mitotic index; chlorophyll content	Low La concentrations stimulated, high concentrations decreased the photo- synthetic rate	de Oliveira et al. [43]
Rice [Oryza sativa]	La[III] [0.05–1.5 mM]	Redox endpoints	Increased catalase and peroxidase by 0.05 and 0.1 mM La[III]	Liu et al. [44]
Capsicum annum	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [10 µM]	Seedling height; shoot diameter	Increased growth	García-Jiménez et al. [45]
Rice[Oryza sativa]	Sc[III] [25 and 50 μM]	Germination; oxidative stress parameters	Improved germination; decreased oxida- tive stress	Elbasan et al. [46]
Phaseolus vulgaris	Ce[NO <sub>3</sub> ] <sub>3</sub> 6H <sub>2</sub> O [0.1–72.9 mM]	Survival rate and growth vs. water stress	Increased photosynthesis rate, chloro- phyll content, and water use efficiency	Salgado et al. [47]
Orange [Poncirus trifoliate] Fungi and microbes	Ce[NO <sub>3</sub> ] <sub>3</sub> 6H <sub>2</sub> O [0.25-4 mM]	Growth kinetics; chlorophyll content	Different hormetic effects	Yin et al. [48]
Trichoderma atroviride and Tricho- derma harzianum	La and REE mix [0.003 to 900 mM]	Accumulation of REE in fungal biomass Increased growth	Increased growth	d'Aquino et al. [49]
Escherichia coli	16 REEs	Growth kinetics	Different hormetic effects	Técher et al. [50]
Microbial communities	Y[III] [ $\leq 20 \text{ mg/L}$ ] or [20–500 mg/L]	Ammonia-oxidizing bacteria	Increased specific oxygen uptake rate at ≤ 20 mg/L; decreased > 20 mg/L	Su et al. [51]
Autunats and auturat ceus Human dermal fibroblasts	14 REE ions [1–100 μM]	Pro-fibrotic responses in tissue injury	Increased proliferation by low REE lev- lets: decreased proliferation by higher	Jenkins et al. [52]
Murine preosteoblast cell line MC3T3-E1	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [10 <sup>-9</sup> -10 <sup>-3</sup> M]	Proliferation; osteogenic differentiation, and mineralization	Upregulated below 10 <sup>-6</sup> M, downregu- lated at 10 <sup>-3</sup> M	Liu et al. [86]
Mice	CeO <sub>2</sub> [nanoparticles] [0.5 mg/kg]	ROS production	Decreased ROS	Hirst et al. [53]
Sprague–Dawley rats	Y <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> [20–320 ppm]	Body weight; spatial learning and memory; anogenital distance	Increased at 20 ppm; decreased at 320 ppm	Zhang et al. [54]

min ColdeT

have focused on some molecular endpoints in plants exposed to REE-containing fertilizers. Xu and Wang [57] found increased phosphorus uptake in maize after application of REE (La and Ce)-containing fertilizer, with applications of less than 10 kg/ha reported as increasing crop yield. Cheng et al. [58] exposed navel orange (Citrus sinensis) plants to a REE mixture (38.6 to 546 mg/kg in soil) by measuring a set of fruit quality indicators, including titratable acidity, total soluble solids, and vitamin C. The outcome was improved internal fruit quality in REE-exposed navel orange. A recent report by Lian et al. [59] investigated the effects of  $La^{3+}$  on growth, photosynthetic ability, and phosphorus-use efficiency (PUE) in various organs of adzuki bean Vigna angularis seedlings. Treatment of young seedlings with La<sup>3+</sup> at 150 mg/L improved PUE in roots, stems, and leaves via the regulation of root elongation and activation of root physiological responses to P deficiency. La<sup>3+</sup> increased the level of superoxide dismutase and peroxidase, while it significantly decreased malondialdehyde content. The negative effects of P-deficiency on net photosynthetic rate, transpiration rate, and chlorophyll content in leaves were alleviated by La<sup>3+</sup> treatment.

#### **REEs in Livestock Feed Additives**

Analogous to their use in fertilizers, REEs have been used in Chinese zootechny as livestock feed additives, as reported by Wang and Xu [60] in their review of an extensive body of literature encompassing Chinese and Japanese papers dating back to the 1980s and the 1990s, and in a recent review by Abdelnour et al. [61]. Mechanistic and up-to-date reports are summarized in Table 3. He et al. [62] tested diet supplementation of a REE mixture in piglets (300 mg/kg) and reported an increased body weight gain and feed conversion ratio. The same positive effects were found by Wang and Xu [60] who supplemented piglets with  $LaCl_3$  (100 mg/kg BW). A recent study by Xiong et al. [63] evaluated the effects of a REE mixture (200 mg/kg BW) on sows and their offspring, observing improved antioxidant activity, immunity, reproduction of sows, and growth of piglets. Liu et al. [64] supplemented Simmental steers with LaCl<sub>3</sub> (400 to 1800 mg/day) and found improved rumen fermentation, urinary excretion, and feed digestibility. Renner et al. [65] supplemented fattening bulls with a mixture of REE citrates (100 to 300 mg/ kg dry matter) and found that REE supplementation affected dry matter intake, but not live weight gain, clinical chemical parameters, and ion concentrations significantly. Peripheral blood mononuclear cells were significantly increased in REE-supplemented bulls. He et al. [62] fed Ross broiler chicks with either the chloride or citrate salts of REEs, and found improved growth performance of broilers without affecting carcass composition and health of the broilers. Cai et al. [66] fed broiler chickens with REE-enriched yeast (500 to 1500 mg/kg BW) and found improved growth performance. Durmuş and Bölükbaşı [67] supplemented laying hens with  $La_2O_3$  (100 to 400 mg/kg BW) and observed improved feed conversion ratio, egg production, and egg shell life. In further work, the same group [8] supplemented laying hens with CeO<sub>2</sub>, finding similar results as increased egg shell breaking strength and decreased oxidative stress parameters.

Beyond those experimental reports, it must be recognized that an official stamp of approval for the use of REE-based feed additives in a more widespread way globally is yet to be forthcoming, as reviewed by Squadrone et al. [68]. At least in one case, to our knowledge, a safety statement was provided by the EFSA Panel FEEDAP [69] for the feed additive Lancer®, a REE citrate mixture to be used in piglet diet. The EFSA Panel stated that uncertainty still remains on possible developmental neurotoxicity of Lancer® since it was unable to identify a no observed adverse effect level. However, the FEEDAP Panel considered that exposure to La and Ce from products of animals treated with Lancer® at 250 mg/kg feed would not add a significant contribution to the background exposure of these elements. The FEEDAP Panel concluded that the use of Lancer® in feed for weaned piglets according to the proposed conditions of use does not represent a safety concern for the consumer and for the environment.

Though there is currently little data available on the progress of other candidate feed additives, it is to be expected that increasing knowledge on the hormetic effects of REE-based materials will lead to further regulatory approval of REE-containing feed additives in the not-too-distant future.

### Toward Production of REE Mixtures as Hormetic Agents

Under a historical perspective, the pioneering studies of hormesis by Stebbing [70] in 1982, revisiting the nineteenthcentury Arndt-Schulz Law, have now made hormesis a wellknown phenomenon in biological sciences, medicine, and pharmacology. In the more specific fields of agriculture and zootechny, and in the use of REEs as ingredients for fertilizers and feed additives, a persuasive body of evidence reports advantages to using REEs for increasing crop yield and livestock performance. Indeed, as well-theorized by Edward Calabrese and his group [11–13, 38], REEs display hormetic dose-response trends, just as with a number of other chemical and physical agents, which are being underpinned with increasingly sophisticated theoretical frameworks [71–74]. However, it should be noted that REEs are rarely present individually but usually more likely as a mixture of REEs. For this reason, it is timely to begin considering the effect on biota of multiple REEs concomitantly present, particularly at very low concentrations and how hormetic effects might

Animal groups	REE	Endpoints	Observed effects	References
Pigs				
[Duroc×Lan- drace×Yorkshire] piglets	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [100 mg/kg BW]	Average daily weight gain; feed conversion ratio	Increased parameters	Wang and Xu [60]
Deutsche Lan- drasse×Piétrain piglets	REE mixture [300 mg/kg BW]	Body weight gain; feed conversion ratio	Improved endpoints	He et al. [61]
[Landrace×York- shire]×Duroc finishing pigs	REE-enriched yeast [500 – 1500 mg/kg BW]	Average daily weight gain; gain to feed ratio	Improved endpoints	Cai et al. [62]
Sows and offspring	REE mixture [200 mg/kg BW]	Antioxidant activity; immunity; reproduc- tion of sows and piglets; growth of offspring; microbiota	Endpoints improvements	Xiong et al. [87]
Cattle				
Simmental steers	LaCl <sub>3</sub> [400–1800 mg/day]	Rumen fermentation, urinary excretion, digest- ibility	Improved endpoints	Liu et al. [63]
Fattening bulls	REE citrate [100–300 mg/ kg dry matter]	Dry matter intake; weight gain; chemical param- eters	Contrasting outcomes	Renner et al. [64]
Fowl				
Ross broiler chicks	REE-chloride [40 mg/kg] REE-citrate [70 mg/kg]	Weight increase [chill, breast, wing]	Improved growth perfor- mance	He et al. [65]
ROSS 308 broilers	REE- enriched yeast [500–1500 mg/kg BW]	Gross energy digestibility; growth performance, and relative organ weight	Improved endpoints	Cai et al. [88]
Lohman LSL hens	La <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> [100–400 mg/kg BW]	Egg quality, fatty acids composition of yolk, and egg lipid peroxidation	Improved feed conversion ratio; egg production, and egg shell life	Durmuş and Bölükbaşı [66]
Lohman LSL hens	CeO <sub>2</sub> [100–400 mg/kg BW]	Feed conversion ratio and egg production	Increased egg shell break- ing strength; decreased oxidative stress	Bölükbaşı et al. [8]

Table 3 Selected REE-related literature: use of REE-based feed additives

be modulated or negated. For example, as observed by Jacob et al. [75], when pharmaceuticals such as diazepam and simvastatin are individually present at concentrations below the no observable effect concentration, combinations of these at such concentrations indicate toxicity, e.g., to *Aliivibrio fischeri*. Hence, the need should be recognized for more studies involving mixtures, particularly at very low concentrations, since chemicals are subject to interactions and modifications which may result in antagonistic, additive, or synergistic effects.

This was the case, reported in our early studies [76, 77], of a shift from stimulation to inhibition of sea urchin sperm fertilization rate by exposures to sub-micromolar levels of either cadmium or zinc, compared to their mixtures, respectively. Subsequent and recent investigations have further explored the concentration-related hormetic trends of several agents compared to their binary or multiple mixtures, such as antibiotics [78–80], industry wastewater [81], pharmaceuticals [82–84], and fungicides [85].

In view of likely developments in the production and use of REE-based fertilizers and feed additives, and in view of open questions persisting on the efficacy of using REE mixtures and their concentration-related trends, ad hoc investigations are required aimed at verifying the single vs. combined use of REEs in these production and use scenarios.

**Funding** Open access funding provided by Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II within the CRUI-CARE Agreement.

#### Declarations

Conflict of Interest The authors declare no competing interests.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes

were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

## References

- Rim KT, Koo KH, Park JS (2013) Toxicological evaluations of rare earths and their health impacts to workers: a literature review. Saf Health Work 4:12–26. https://doi.org/10.5491/SHAW.2013.4. 1.12
- Pagano G, Aliberti F, Guida M, Oral R, Siciliano A, Trifuoggi M, Tommasi F (2015) Rare earth elements in human and animal health: state of art and research priorities. Environ Res 142:215– 220. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2015.06.039
- Pagano G (Ed.) (2016) Rare earth elements in human and environmental health: at crossroads between toxicity and safety. Pan Stanford Ltd., Singapore, ISBN: 978-981-4745-00-0
- Wei B, Li Y, Li H, Yu J, Ye B, Liang T (2013) Rare earth elements in human hair from a mining area of China. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 96:118–123. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2013.05.031
- Hao Z, Li Y, Li H, Wei B, Liao X, Liang T, Yu J (2015) Levels of rare earth elements, heavy metals and uranium in a population living in Baiyun Obo, Inner Mongolia, China: a pilot study. Chemosphere 128:161–170. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.01.057
- Pagano G, Thomas PJ, Di Nunzio A, Trifuoggi M (2019) Human exposures to rare earth elements: present knowledge and research prospects. Environ Res 171:493–500. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. envres.2019.02.004
- Pang X, Li D, Peng A (2002) Application of rare-earth elements in the agriculture of China and its environmental behavior in soil. Environ Sci Pollut Res 9:143–148. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF029 87462
- Bölükbaşı SC, Al-Sagan AA, Ürüşan H, Erhan MK, Durmuş O, Kurt N (2016) Effects of cerium oxide supplementation to laying hen diets on performance, egg quality, some antioxidant enzymes in serum and lipid oxidation in egg yolk. J Anim Physiol Anim Nutr (Berlin) 100:686–693. https://doi.org/10.1111/jpn.12429
- Tariq H, Sharma A, Sarkar S, Ojha L, Pal RP, Mani V (2020) Perspectives for rare earth elements as feed additive in livestock - a review. Asian-Australas J Anim Sci 33:373–381. https://doi.org/ 10.5713/ajas.19.0242
- Tommasi F, Thomas PJ, Pagano G, Perono GA, Oral R, Lyons DM, Toscanesi M, Trifuoggi M (2021) Review of rare earth elements as fertilizers and feed additives: a knowledge gap analysis. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 81:1–10. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s00244-020-00773-4
- Calabrese EJ (2016) The emergence of the dose–response concept in biology and medicine. Int J Mol Sci 17:2034. https://doi.org/ 10.3390/ijms17122034
- Calabrese EJ, Agathokleous E (2021) Pollen biology and hormesis: pollen germination and pollen tube elongation. Sci Total Environ 762:143072. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143072
- Agathokleous E, Kitao M, Calabrese EJ (2020) Hormesis: highly generalizable and beyond laboratory. Trends Plant Sci 25:1076– 1086. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2020.05.006
- 14. Drobkov AA (1941) Influence of cerium, lanthanum, and samarium on development of peas. Proc USSR Acad Sci 32:669–670
- Jha AM, Singh AC (1994) Clastogenicity of lanthanides induction of micronuclei in root tips of *Vicia faba*. Mutat Res 322:169– 172. https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-1218(94)90003-5

- Jha AM, Singh AC (1995) Clastogenicity of lanthanides: induction of chromosomal aberration in bone marrow cells of mice in vivo. Mutat Res 341:193–197. https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-1218(95)90009-8
- 17. Hu X, Ding Z, Chen Y, Wang X, Dai L (2002) Bioaccumulation of lanthanum and cerium and their effects on the growth of wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) seedlings. Chemosphere 48:621–629. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0045-6535(02)00109-1
- Xiong SL, Xiong ZT, Chen YC, Huang H (2006) Interactive effects of lanthanum and cadmium on plant growth and mineral element uptake in crisped-leaf mustard under hydroponic conditions. J Plant Nutr 29:1889–1902. https://doi.org/10.1080/01904 160600899485
- Thomas PJ, Carpenter D, Boutin C, Allison JE (2014) Rare earth elements (REEs): effects on germination and growth of selected crop and native plant species. Chemosphere 96:57–66. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.07.020
- Carpenter D, Boutin C, Allison JE, Parsons JL, Ellis DM (2015) Uptake and effects of six rare earth elements (REEs) on selected native and crop species growing in contaminated soils. PLoS One 10:e0129936. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0129936
- Kotelnikova A, Fastovets I, Rogova O, Volkov DS, Stolbova V (2019) Toxicity assay of lanthanum and cerium in solutions and soil. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 167:20–28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. ecoenv.2018.09.117
- 22. Siciliano A, Guida M, Serafini S, Micillo M, Galdiero E, Carfagna S, Salbitani G, Tommasi F, Lofrano G, Padilla Suarez EG, Gjata I, Brouziotis AA, Trifuoggi M, Liguori R, Race M, Fabbricino M, Libralato G (2021) Long-term multi-endpoint exposure of the microalga *Raphidocelis subcapitata* to lanthanum and cerium. Sci Total Environ 790:148229. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.148229
- 23. Kawagoe M, Ishikawa K, Wang SC, Yoshikawa K, Arany S, Zhou XP, Wang JS, Ueno Y, Koizumi Y, Kameda T, Koyota S, Sugiyama T (2008) Acute effects on the lung and the liver of oral administration of cerium chloride on adult, neonatal and fetal mice. J Trace Elem Med Biol 22:59–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtemb.2007.08.003
- He X, Zhang Z, Zhang H, Zhao Y, Chai Z (2008) Neurotoxicological evaluation of long-term lanthanum chloride exposure in rats. Toxicol Sci 103:354–361. https://doi.org/10.1093/toxsci/kfn046
- 25. Hardas SS, Butterfield DA, Sultana R, Tseng MT, Dan M, Florence RL, Unrine JM, Graham UM, Wu P, Grulke EA, Yokel RA (2010) Brain distribution and toxicological evaluation of a systemically delivered engineered nanoscale ceria. Toxicol Sci 116:562–576. https://doi.org/10.1093/toxsci/kfq137
- Huang P, Li J, Zhang S, Chen C, Han Y, Liu N, Xiao Y, Wang H, Zhang M, Yu Q, Liu Y, Wang W (2011) Effects of lanthanum, cerium, and neodymium on the nuclei and mitochondria of hepatocytes: accumulation and oxidative damage. Environ Toxicol Pharmacol 31:25–32. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.etap.2010.09.001
- Nalabotu SK, Kolli MB, Triest WE, Ma JY, Manne ND, Katta A, Addagarla HS, Rice KM, Blough ER (2011) Intratracheal instillation of cerium oxide nanoparticles induces hepatic toxicity in male Sprague-Dawley rats. Int J Nanomed 6:2327–2335. https:// doi.org/10.2147/IJN.S25119
- Zhao H, Cheng Z, Hu R, Chen J, Hong M, Zhou M, Gong X, Wang L, Hong F (2011) Oxidative injury in the brain of mice caused by lanthanid. Biol Trace Elem Res 142:174–189. https:// doi.org/10.1007/s12011-010-8759-1
- Zhao H, Cheng J, Cai J, Cheng Z, Cui Y, Gao G, Hu R, Gong X, Wang L, Hong F (2012) Liver injury and its molecular mechanisms in mice caused by exposure to cerium chloride. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 62:154–164. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00244-011-9672-0
- Zhao H, Hong J, Yu X, Zhao X, Sheng L, Ze Y, Sang X, Gui S, Sun Q, Wang L, Hong F (2013) Oxidative stress in the kidney injury of mice following exposure to lanthanides trichloride. Chemosphere 93:875–884. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere. 2013.05.034

- Aalapati S, Ganapathy S, Manapuram S, Anumolu G, Prakya BM (2014) Toxicity and bio-accumulation of inhaled cerium oxide nanoparticles in CD1 mice. Nanotoxicology 8:786–798. https:// doi.org/10.3109/17435390.2013.829877
- 32. Cheng J, Fei M, Fei M, Sang X, Sang X, Cheng Z, Gui S, Zhao X, Sheng L, Sun Q, Hu R, Wang L, Hong F (2014) Gene expression profile in chronic mouse liver injury caused by long-term exposure to CeCl<sub>3</sub>. Environ Toxicol 29:837–846. https://doi.org/10.1002/tox.21826
- 33. Hong J, Yu X, Pan X, Zhao X, Sheng L, Sang X, Lin A, Zhang C, Zhao Y, Gui S, Sun Q, Wang L, Hong F (2014) Pulmonary toxicity in mice following exposure to cerium chloride. Biol Trace Elem Res 159:269–277. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12011-014-9953-3
- Zhang H, He X, Bai W, Guo X, Zhang Z, Chai Z, Zhao Y (2010) Ecotoxicological assessment of lanthanum with *Caenorhabditis elegans* in liquid medium. Metallomics 2:806–810. https://doi. org/10.1039/c0mt00059k
- 35. Cui J, Zhang Z, Bai W, Zhang L, He X, Ma Y, Liu Y, Chai Z (2012) Effects of rare earth elements La and Yb on the morphological and functional development of zebrafish embryos. J Environ Sci (China)24:209–213. https://doi.org/10.1016/s1001-0742(11)60755-9
- 36. Oral R, Pagano G, Siciliano A, Gravina M, Palumbo A, Castellano I, Migliaccio O, Thomas PJ, Guida M, Tommasi F, Trifuoggi M (2017) Heavy rare earth elements affect early life stages in *Paracentrotus lividus* and *Arbacia lixula* sea urchins. Environ Res 154:240–246. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2017.01.011
- 37. Trifuoggi M, Pagano G, Guida M, Palumbo A, Siciliano A, Gravina M, Lyons DM, Burić P, Levak M, Thomas PJ, Giarra A, Oral R (2017) Comparative toxicity of seven rare earth elements in sea urchin early life stages. Environ Sci Pollut Res 24:20803– 20810. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-017-9658-1
- Calabrese EJ, Blain R (2005) The occurrence of hormetic dose responses in the toxicological literature, the hormesis database: an overview. Toxicol Appl Pharmacol 202:289–301. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.taap.2004.06.023
- Mattson MP (2008) Hormesis defined. Ageing Res Rev 7:1–7. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.arr.2007.08.007
- Fashui H, Ling W, Chao L (2003) Study of lanthanum on seed germination and growth of rice. Biol Trace Elem Res 94:273–286. https://doi.org/10.1385/BTER:94:3:273
- Wang C, He M, Shi W, Wong J, Cheng T, Wang X, Hu L, Chen F (2011) Toxicological effects involved in risk assessment of rare earth lanthanum on roots of *Vicia faba* L. seedlings. J Environ Sci (China) 23:1721–1728. https://doi.org/10.1016/s1001-0742(10) 60598-0
- 42. Ma JJ, Ren YJ, Yan LY (2014) Effects of spray application of lanthanum and cerium on yield and quality of Chinese cabbage (*Brassica chinensis* L) based on different seasons. Biol Trace Elem Res 160:427–432. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s12011-014-0062-0
- 43. de Oliveira C, Ramos CJ, Siqueira JO, Faquin V, de Castro EM, Amaral DC, Techio VH, Coelho LC, e Silva PHP, Schnug E, Guilherme LRG, (2015) Bioaccumulation and effects of lanthanum on growth and mitotic index in soybean plants. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 122:136–144. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2015.07.020
- 44. Liu D, Zheng S, Wang X (2016) Lanthanum regulates the reactive oxygen species in the roots of rice seedlings. Sci Rep 6:31860. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep31860
- 45. García-Jiménez AG, Gómez-Merino FC, Tejeda-Sartorius O, Trejo-Téllez LI (2017) Lanthanum affects bell pepper seedling quality depending on the genotype and time of exposure by differentially modifying plant height, stem diameter and concentrations of chlorophylls, sugars, amino acids, and proteins. Front Plant Sci 8:308. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2017.00308

- 46. Elbasan F, Ozfidan-Konakci C, Yildiztugay E, Kucukoduk M (2020) Rare-earth element scandium improves stomatal regulation and enhances salt and drought stress tolerance by up-regulating antioxidant responses of *Oryza sativa*. Plant Physiol Biochem 152:157–169. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plaphy.2020.04.040
- Salgado OGG, Teodoro JC, Alvarenga JP, de Oliveira C, de Carvalho TS, Domiciano D, Marchiori PER, Guilherme LRG (2020) Cerium alleviates drought-induced stress in *Phaseolus vulgaris*. J Rare Earths 38:324–331. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jre.2019.07.014
- 48. Yin H, Wang J, Zeng Y, Shen X, He Y, Ling L, Cao L, Fu X, Peng L, Chun C (2021) Effect of the rare earth element lanthanum (La) on the growth and development of citrus rootstock seedlings. Plant 10:1388. https://doi.org/10.3390/plants1007 1388
- 49. d'Aquino L, Morgana M, Carboni MA, Staiano M, Vittori Antisari M, Re M, Lorito M, Vinale F, Abadi KM, Woo SL (2009) Effect of some rare earth elements on the growth and lanthanide accumulation in different Trichoderma strains. Soil Biol Biochem 41:2406–2413. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2009.08.012
- Técher D, Grosjean N, Sohm B, Blaudez D, Le Jean M (2020) Not merely noxious? Time-dependent hormesis and differential toxic effects systematically induced by rare earth elements in *Escherichia coli*. Environ Sci Pollut Res 27:5640–5649. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s11356-019-07002-z
- 51. Su H, Zhang D, Antwi P, Xiao L, Liu Z, Deng X, Asumadu-Sakyi AB, Li J (2020) Effects of heavy rare earth element (yttrium) on partial-nitritation process, bacterial activity and structure of responsible microbial communities. Sci Total Environ 705:135797. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.135797
- 52. Jenkins W, Perone P, Walker K, Bhagavathula N, Aslam MN, DaSilva M, Dame MK, Varani J (2011) Fibroblast response to lanthanoid metal ion stimulation: potential contribution to fibrotic tissue injury. Biol Trace Elem Res 144:621–635. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s12011-011-9041-x
- Hirst SM, Karakoti A, Singh S, Self W, Tyler R, Seal S, Reilly CM (2013) Bio-distribution and in vivo antioxidant effects of cerium oxide nanoparticles in mice. Environ Toxicol 28:107–118. https:// doi.org/10.1002/tox.20704
- Zhang WZ, Sun NN, Ma SQ, Zhao ZC, Cao Y, Zhang C (2018) Hormetic effects of yttrium on male Sprague-Dawley rats. Biomed Environ Sci 31:777–780. https://doi.org/10.3967/bes2018.104
- 55. Wu Z, Tang X, Tsui C (1983) Studies on the effect of rare earth elements on the increasement of yield in agriculture. J Chinese Rare Earth Soc 1:70–75
- 56. Xu X, Zhu W, Wang Z, Witkamp GJ (2002) Distributions of rare earths and heavy metals in field-grown maize after application of rare earth-containing fertilizer. Sci Total Environ 293:97–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0048-9697(01)01150-0
- Xu X, Wang Z (2007) Phosphorus uptake and translocation in field grown maize after application of rare earth-containing fertilizer. J Plant Nutr 30:557–568. https://doi.org/10.1080/0190416070 1209287
- 58. Cheng J, Ding C, Li X, Zhang T, Wang X (2015) Rare earth element transfer from soil to navel orange pulp (*Citrus sinensis* Osbeck cv. Newhall) and the effects on internal fruit quality. PLoS One 10:e0120618. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0120618
- Lian H, Qin C, Zhang L, Zhang C, Li H, Zhang S (2019) Lanthanum nitrate improves phosphorus-use efficiency and tolerance to phosphorus-deficiency stress in *Vigna angularis* seedlings. Protoplasma 256:383–392. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00709-018-1304-3
- Wang MQ, Xu ZR (2003) Effect of supplemental lanthanum on the growth performance of pigs. Asian-Australas J Anim Sci 16:1360–1363. https://doi.org/10.5713/ajas.2003.1360
- 61. Abdelnour SA, Abd El-Hack ME, Khafaga AF, Noreldin AE, Arif M, Chaudhry MT, Losacco C, Abdeen A, Abdel-Daim MM

(2019) Impacts of rare earth elements on animal health and production: highlights of cerium and lanthanum. Sci Total Environ 672:1021–1032. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.02.270

- 62. He ML, Ranz D, Rambeck WA (2001) Study on performance enhancing effect of rare earth elements in growing and fattening pigs. J Anim Physiol Anim Nutr (Berlin) 85:263–270. https://doi. org/10.1046/j.1439-0396.2001.00327.x
- 63. Xiong Y, Pang J, Lv L, Wu Y, Li N, Huang S, Feng Z, Ren Y, Wang J (2019) Effects of maternal supplementation with rare earth elements during late gestation and lactation on performances, health, and fecal microbiota of the sows and their offspring. Animals (Basel) 9:E738. https://doi.org/10.3390/ani9100738
- 64. Liu, Q, Wang, C, Huang, YX, Dong, KH, Yang, WZ, Wang, H (2008) Effects of lanthanum on rumen fermentation, urinary excretion of purine derivatives and digestibility in steers. Anim Feed Sci Technol 142:121–132. https://doi.org/anifeedsci.2007. 008.02
- 65. Renner L, Schwabe A, Döll S, Höltershinken M, Dänicke S (2011) Effect of rare earth elements on beef cattle growth performance, blood clinical chemical parameters and mitogen stimulated proliferation of bovine peripheral blood mononuclear cells in vitro and ex vivo. Toxicol Lett 201:277–284. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. toxlet.2011.01.014
- 66. Cai L, Park YS, Seong SI, Yoo SW, Kim IH (2015) Effects of rare earth elements-enriched yeast on growth performance, nutrient digestibility, meat quality, relative organ weight and excreta microflora in broiler chickens. Livestock Sci 172:43–49. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.livsci.2014.11.013
- Durmuş O, Bölükbaşı ŞC (2015) Biological activities of lanthanum oxide in laying hens. J Appl Poultry Res 24:481–488. https:// doi.org/10.3382/japr/pfv052
- Squadrone S, Stella C, Brizio P, Abete MC (2018) A baseline study of the occurrence of rare earth elements in animal feed. Water Air Soil Pollut 229:190. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11270-018-3825-y
- 69. EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP), Bampidis V, Azimonti G, Bastos ML, Christensen H, Dusemund B, Kouba M, Kos Durjava M, López-Alonso M, López Puente S, Marcon F, Mayo B, Pechová A, Petkova M, Ramos F, Sanz Y, Villa RE, Woutersen R, Finizio A, Focks A, Svensson K, Teodorovic I, Tosti L, Tarrés-Call J, Manini P, Pizzo F (2019) Safety of Lancer (lanthanide citrate) as a zootechnical additive for weaned piglets. EFSA J 17:5912. https://doi.org/10. 2903/j.efsa.2019.5912
- Stebbing AR (1982) Hormesis the stimulation of growth by low levels of inhibitors. Sci Total Environ 22:213–234. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/0048-9697(82)90066-3
- Cedergreen N, Streibig JC, Kudsk P, Mathiassen SK, Duke SO (2006) The occurrence of hormesis in plants and algae. Dose Response 5:150–162. https://doi.org/10.2203/dose-response.06-008.Cedergreen
- Pagano G, Castello G, Gallo M, Borriello I, Guida M (2008) Complex mixture-associated hormesis and toxicity: the case of leather tanning industry. Dose Response 6:383–396. https://doi.org/10. 2203/dose-response.08-013.Pagano
- 73. Qu R, Xiao K, Hu J, Liang S, Hou H, Liu B, Chen F, Xu Q, Wu X, Yang J (2019) Predicting the hormesis and toxicological interaction of mixtures by an improved inverse distance weighted interpolation. Environ Int 130:104892. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. envint.2019.06.002
- 74. Katsnelson BA, Panov VG, Minigalieva IA, Bushueva TV, Gurvich VB, Privalova LI, Klinova SV, Sutunkova MP (2021) On an extended understanding of the term "hormesis" for denoting alternating directions of the organism's response to increasing adverse exposures. Toxicology 447:152629. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tox.2020.152629

- 75. Jacob RS, de Souza Santos LV, d'Auriol M, Lebron YAR, Moreira VR, Lange LC (2020) Diazepam, metformin, omeprazole and simvastatin: a full discussion of individual and mixture acute toxicity. Ecotoxicol 29:1062–1071. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10646-020-02239-8
- 76. Pagano G, Esposito A, Giordano GG (1982) Fertilization and larval development in sea urchins following exposure of gametes and embryos to cadmium. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 11:47–55. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01055185
- 77. Pagano G, Cipollaro M, Corsale G, Esposito A, Ragucci E, Giordano GG, Trieff NM (1986) The sea urchin: Bioassay for the assessment of damage from environmental contaminants. In: Cairns J, Jr. (Ed.) Community Toxicity Testing. Association for Standard Testing and Materials, Philadelphia, pp. 67-92. ISBN O-8031-0488-X
- de Vasconcelos EC, Dalke CR, de Oliveira CMR (2017) Influence of select antibiotics on *Vibrio fischeri* and *Desmodesmus subspicatus* at µg L(-1) concentrations. Environ Manage 60:157–164. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-017-0841-4
- 79. Jiang Y, Liu Y, Zhang J (2021) Mechanisms for the stimulatory effects of a five-component mixture of antibiotics in *Microcystis aeruginosa* at transcriptomic and proteomic levels. J Hazard Mater 406:124722. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.124722
- Sun H, Pan Y, Chen X, Jiang W, Lin Z, Yin C (2020) Regular time-dependent cross-phenomena induced by hormesis: a case study of binary antibacterial mixtures to *Aliivibrio fischeri*. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 187:109823. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv. 2019.109823
- De Nicola E, Meriç S, Gallo M, Iaccarino M, Della Rocca C, Lofrano G, Russo T, Pagano G (2007) Vegetable and synthetic tannins induce hormesis/toxicity in sea urchin early development and in algal growth. Environ Pollut 146:46–54. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.envpol.2006.06.018
- Backhaus T, Porsbring T, Arrhenius A, Brosche S, Johansson P, Blanck H (2011) Single-substance and mixture toxicity of five pharmaceuticals and personal care products to marine periphyton communities. Environ Toxicol Chem 30:2030–2040. https://doi. org/10.1002/etc.586
- Bain PA, Kumar A (2014) Cytotoxicity of binary mixtures of human pharmaceuticals in a fish cell line: approaches for nonmonotonic concentration-response relationships. Chemosphere 108:334–342. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.01.077
- Gottardi M, Birch MR, Dalhoff K, Cedergreen N (2017) The effects of epoxiconazole and α-cypermethrin on *Daphnia magna* growth, reproduction, and offspring size. Environ Toxicol Chem 36:2155–2166. https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.3752
- Zhang R, Zhang Y, Xu Q, Li J, Zhu F (2019) Hormetic effects of mixtures of dimethachlone and prochloraz on *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. Plant Dis 103:546–554. https://doi.org/10.1094/ PDIS-06-18-1071-RE
- Liu D, Zhang J, Wang G, Liu X, Wang S, Yang MS (2012) The dual-effects of LaCl<sub>3</sub> on the proliferation, osteogenic differentiation, and mineralization of MC3T3-E1 cells. Biol Trace Elem Res 150:433–440. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12011-012-9486-6
- Cai L, Nyachoti CM, Kim IH (2018) Impact of rare earth element enriched yeast on growth performance, nutrient digestibility, blood profile, and fecal microflora in finishing pigs. Canad J Anim Sci 98:34–7353. https://doi.org/10.1139/cjas-2017-0089
- He ML, Wehr U, Rambeck WA (2010) Effect of low doses of dietary rare earth elements on growth performance of broilers. J Anim Physiol Anim Nutr (Berlin) 94:86–92. https://doi.org/10. 1111/j.1439-0396.2008.00884.x

**Publisher's Note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.